

Model for Appointing Sub-district Heads in Gorontalo City

Jitro Paputungan¹, Udin Hamim¹, Rustam Tohopi¹

Master of Public Administration Study Program, Gorontalo State University, Indonesia

ARTICLE INFO

Received: 18 Jun 2025

Revised: 16 Sep 2025

Accepted: 25 Oct 2025

Keywords:

Appointment Model
Sub-district Head
Gorontalo City

Corresponding Author:

Jitro Paputungan
Email: jitropapu@gmail.com



Copyright © 2025 by author(s).

This work is licensed under the
Creative Commons Attribution
International License (CC BY 4.0).
[http://creativecommons.org/licenses/
by/4.0/](http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/)



ABSTRACT

The purpose of this research is to find out and describe: 1) The Gorontalo City Government Policy in the Sub-district Head Appointment Model in the Gorontalo City Regional Government Environment. 2) Factors that determine the success of the sub-district head appointment model in Gorontalo City. The approach used in this research is qualitative with descriptive qualitative methods. By involving informants who are in accordance with the capacity related to the focus and sub-focus of the research. The informants consist of authorized officials such as personnel development officials, regional secretaries, heads of regional personnel agencies, and sub-district heads. Data collection techniques in the form of observation, interviews, and documentation, then analyzed using the concept of Miles and Huberman which consists of data collection, data reduction, data presentation, and drawing conclusions or checks. As a conclusion in this research is, 1. The Sub-district Head Appointment Model in Gorontalo City, has not fully complied with the provisions of Article 224 of Law Number 23 of 2014 concerning Regional Government, which is based on a). Educational Background, namely not all sub-district heads appointed to office are those who master the technical aspects of government as evidenced by a bachelor's degree/diploma in government science or a civil service certificate. b). The selection method, carried out in a closed manner in accordance with regulatory provisions, but it is best to do it with an open method because the sub-district head position is a public position that is in direct contact with the community. c). The availability of resources exceeds the number of seats or sub-district head positions available, but the appointed apparatus does not fully match the qualifications. The bureaucratic structure is through the Mayor's policy to transfer to the Personnel Agency or the performance assessment team (TPK). Furthermore, the TPK conducts a selection of ASN who meet the requirements to be recommended to the Mayor for appointment as sub-district heads.

INTRODUCTION

Based on the spirit of regional autonomy, the Government of the Republic of Indonesia is reforming the government system at both the central and regional levels (Mukhlis et al., 2024; Mukhlis, 2025). Article 18 paragraph (1) of the 1945 Constitution of the Republic of Indonesia stipulates that the Unitary State of the Republic of Indonesia is divided into provincial regions, and these provincial regions are divided into regencies and cities, each of which has a regional government. Regional governments consist of regional apparatus organizations, such as the Regional Secretariat, the Regional People's Representative Council (DPRD) Secretariat, agencies, agencies, and bureaus. For district/city governments, there are sub-districts, as well as villages and urban villages.

Law No. 23 of 2014 concerning Regional Government stipulates that sub-districts are work or

service units, no longer governmental units. Sub-districts now have the status of district/city apparatuses, as regulated in Article 209 paragraph (2) of Law No. According to Law No. 23 of 2014 concerning Regional Government, the district/city regional apparatus consists of the regional secretariat, the Regional People's Representative Council (DPRD) secretariat, agencies, agencies, and sub-districts. Sub-districts were established to coordinate the implementation of government, public services, and community empowerment in villages/kelurahan.

Sub-district institutions are the spearhead of regional government, overseeing sub-districts and villages in providing services to the public and implementing development. Given that sub-districts are the spearheads directly involved in community issues, poor professionalism of sub-district-level employees will impact the public's image of service delivery. In running the institution, sub-districts are led by sub-district heads (camat), appointed by the Regent/Mayor. Currently, sub-district heads no longer serve as sub-district heads and serve as instruments of the central government in carrying out deconcentrated tasks. Instead, they have become regional apparatuses with some regional autonomy and governance authority as stipulated in Law No. 23 of 2014 concerning Regional Government.

The appointment of a sub-district head by the Regent or Mayor is of course guided by applicable regulations. For example, as stipulated in Article 224 of Law Number 23 of 2014 concerning Regional Government, a civil servant appointed to the position of sub-district head must master technical knowledge of government. The explanation of this article states that mastery of technical knowledge of government is evidenced by a diploma or bachelor's degree in government or civil service (Ediagbonya & Aghatise, 2023). In practice, considering the educational background of civil servants appointed as sub-district heads, many local governments still fail to heed this requirement.

The appointment of sub-district heads, using educational background as the primary indicator, signifies that employee placement aligns with the principle of "the right man in the right place," meaning placing the right person in the right position, and ultimately yielding better results because it aligns with their field of expertise. Benardin & Russel (in Tanjung & Novadjaja, 2015) state that three criteria must be met when placing employees in a position. The first is the appropriateness of knowledge acquired through education. The second is the appropriateness of skills, which can be divided into technical skills, related skills, and conceptual skills. And the third is the employee's attitude or appropriateness of abilities, which can be divided into intellectual and physical abilities.

Education refers to the employee's educational background, their ability to perform the work they will be responsible for, and their understanding of the work they will be doing. Article 224 of Law Number 23 of 2014 explains that sub-district heads must possess technical government skills, evidenced by a diploma/bachelor's degree in government or a professional civil service certificate. In the 2017 list of sub-district heads in Gorontalo City (table 1.1), only four sub-district heads met the criteria stipulated in Article 224 of Law No. 23 of 2014 concerning Regional Government, while the other five sub-district heads obtained civil service certificates after assuming their positions.

The Gorontalo City Government, through Gorontalo Mayoral Regulation No. 51 of 2016 concerning the position, organizational structure, duties and functions, and work procedures of sub-districts, regulates the position of sub-district head. In this regulation, the sub-district head is defined as an echelon IIIa structural official or administrator. The appointment and dismissal of sub-district heads are carried out by the Mayor of Gorontalo in accordance with applicable laws and regulations. According to the Gorontalo Mayoral Regulation, the legal appointment of sub-district heads is regulated by Law No. 5 of 2014 concerning the State Civil Apparatus, Government Regulation No. This is regulated by Law No. 11 of 2017 concerning Civil Servant Management and is also regulated by Law No. 23 of 2014 concerning Regional Government.

The number of Civil Servants (PNS) in Gorontalo City is 3,872 (BKD data, 2024). The Gorontalo City Government, despite the total number of PNS, does not lack PNS with government education backgrounds, as the number reaches 257, while the number of sub-district heads is only nine. In an effort to maintain clean positions and avoid collusion, corruption, and nepotism, or political ties, the appointment of sub-district heads should prioritize individual skills or a merit system. According to Ogunleye (2006), where skills are objectively assessed, educational qualifications are generally used as the basis for consideration.

Therefore, prospective sub-district heads should possess technical knowledge of government, as evidenced by a diploma or bachelor's degree in government (Forkuor & Adjei, 2016). Article 224, paragraph 3 of Law Number 23 of 2014 concerning Regional Government, clearly stipulates that sub-district heads appointed without the required qualifications may be dismissed by the Governor, the representative of the central government in the region. In addition to prioritizing individual competence, regional governments would also be more appropriate to conduct a tender process for sub-district heads, similar to that used for high-ranking positions or leadership positions in regional government organizations.

Zuliyah & Triwahyuningsih (2021) and Elsy (2022) said that, this tender process has been implemented in several regions, with the establishment of Regional Regulations or Regional Head Regulations as the legal framework for sub-district head appointments. This policy has been implemented by the Purworejo Regency Government, Central Java Province, through Regent Regulation (Perbub) Number 21 of 2019 concerning the Open Filling of Sub-district Head and Village Head Positions within the Purworejo Regency Government. The Jakarta Provincial Government has implemented a similar policy through Governor Regulation Number 19 of 2013 concerning the Open Selection of Sub-district Heads and Village Heads. Both regional head regulations stipulate a government education background as a requirement in the selection process (Salim, 2024; Harman, 1994).

The recruitment process for sub-district heads (camatan) should be prioritized, as they are the leaders of sub-districts. According to Law Number 23 of 2014, sub-districts are part of the regional government apparatus within districts/cities, including agencies, agencies, the Regional People's Representative Council (DPRD) Secretariat, and the Regional Secretariat. The recruitment process involves a phased selection process, from administrative selection to interviews. All stages are conducted by an independent selection committee, with minimal interference from the regional head.

METHODOLOGY AND PROCEDURES

This research was conducted at the Gorontalo City Regional Government, specifically at the Gorontalo City Personnel Education and Training Agency (BKPP), and the District Office within the Gorontalo City Regional Government. The basis for determining the research location is because local government agencies such as the BKD and the District Office are agencies directly related to this research. BKPP is a technical personnel agency that is the source of personnel data in the implementation of employee transfers and placements, including sub-district heads, and the sub-district office, which is the sub-district head's office, is the object of this research. This research is a descriptive type with a qualitative approach. Sugiyono (2013) states that qualitative research is used in natural conditions (natural settings). Therefore, qualitative research is also called naturalistic research, because researchers seek phenomena that occur naturally, and describe them according to existing reality and in detail. The researcher used a descriptive qualitative research method. According to Sugiono (2019) is analyzing data by describing the data that has been collected or describing it as it is. Simplification into a form that is easy to understand, read, and interpret is the meaning of descriptive data analysis. Therefore, accurate and reliable data are needed when determining

data analysis. The descriptive qualitative research method attempts to describe the findings of interpretative research results, namely to understand the interpretation and meaning contained. Collecting data and information in accordance with the research focus is an interpretative nature. The reason the researcher used a descriptive qualitative research method, because this study describes the implementation model of employee mutations and official appointments in a case study of the appointment of sub-district heads carried out by the Gorontalo City Regional Government. Qualitative research is scientific, descriptive, and inductive and seeks to find the meaning of the problem that is the focus of the research.

Research Procedures

The procedure began with a search for initial information related to the issue under study, namely the implementation of mutations or filling of sub-district head positions within the Gorontalo City Regional Government. Nawawi (2017) stated that after obtaining initial information regarding the problem to be studied, the next step was to identify the problem, theory, and data. The information obtained must be in-depth and able to explore the insights expressed by the informants. The problem identified in this study was that the placement of sub-district heads was not carried out in accordance with the provisions of Law Number 23 of 2014 concerning regional government, specifically regarding the educational qualifications required for civil servants (ASN) to hold sub-district head positions. Furthermore, the theory used by the researcher was the George C. Edwards III policy implementation model, which divides the process into four determining factors: communication, resource factors, implementer attitudes, and bureaucratic structure.

Data Analysis Techniques

According to Miles and Huberman (Sugiyono, 2007), data analysis activities include data reduction, data visualization, and drawing/verifying conclusions. The data collection, reduction, and verification/drawing conclusions are cyclical processes that occur simultaneously and interact with each other. In this study, informants described their statements or views, which were then expressed in discussions, namely discussions between data findings and the theory used. Evidence was collected and analyzed each time they left the field. The data analysis techniques were consistently implemented in the following stages:

Data Reduction

This was carried out through a selection process, focusing on simplifying, abstracting, and transforming data emerging from written field notes. Data reduction is a form of analysis that filters, classifies, directs, discards unnecessary data, and organizes data so that conclusions can be drawn and verified.

Data Presentation

Data presentation presents a collection of information that offers the possibility of drawing conclusions and taking action.

Drawing Conclusions or Verification

Drawing conclusions is an attempt to discover the meaning of recorded facts regarding possible patterns of configuration explanations, causal pathways, and propositions. Data reduction, data presentation, and conclusion drawing or verification are intertwined activities before, during, and after data collection in parallel.

RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

Model for Appointing Sub-district Heads in Gorontalo City

Based on the indicators for the sub-district head appointment model in Gorontalo City, as contained in the conceptual framework of this study, the results of the study regarding the sub-

district head appointment model implemented by the Gorontalo City Regional Government are as follows:

Educational Background

Article 224 of Law Number 23 of 2014 concerning Regional Government stipulates that educational background is a primary requirement for appointing a civil servant (ASN) to the position of sub-district head. This provision requires a sub-district head to possess technical knowledge of government, as evidenced by a diploma, a bachelor's degree in government, or a certificate of civil service education and training.

As a sub-district head, he serves as the coordinator of government administration within the sub-district, including in general governance, community empowerment, and public services. Technical government skills are crucial for a sub-district head, as they can assist him in carrying out his duties as a regional leader effectively and efficiently. Based on an interview with the first source regarding how educational background is considered in appointing civil servants to the position of sub-district head, IM explained the following:

"Educational background is a factor considered in determining the position of sub-district head. It's not just education, but also experience and acceptance within the community. Education isn't the only factor, but other factors are also crucial. Even if the person's education isn't (a background in government), if other factors meet the requirements, such as acceptance within the community, good leadership, and good communication skills, those are usually the ones who are proposed for appointment as sub-district head. It's not just government education that counts; there are other aspects that are taken into consideration. And usually, after that (sub-district head appointment), the person participates in training," (interview, November 24, 2024).

The interview results above explain that the Gorontalo City Government, in appointing someone as a sub-district head, does not consider an educational background that masters the technical aspects of government as the main factor in determining a civil servant to occupy the position of sub-district head. There are several other factors that make the Mayor of Gorontalo approve the appointment of someone to the position of sub-district head. Such as leadership, having good communication, and most importantly, being accepted by the community. These factors are the main basis for the Gorontalo City Government in appointing sub-district heads, because the position of sub-district head is the leader of the region which in the life of the Gorontalo indigenous people, is called *tulia lo lipu*. Gorontalo City as one of the traditional regions in Indonesia, the local government includes traditional elements in terms of appointing government positions, including the position of sub-district head. The IM source added the following explanation:

*"The appointment of a sub-district head (camat) involves more stringent requirements, including rank and echelon from an administrative perspective. Because a sub-district head is a *tulia lo lipu* (a local authority). He or she is the regional head of the sub-district. Therefore, the sub-district head must be accepted by the community. As *tulia lo lipu*, both formally and legally, they also have customary law requirements. These include going through the *toopu* (customary acceptance process) and taking a customary oath, which states: *Huta, huta lo ito Eya* (The land belongs to my lord); *Tulu, tulu lo ito Eya* (Fire belongs to my lord); *Dupoto, dupoto lo ito Eya* (Wind, wind belongs to my lord); *Tawu, tawu lo ito Eya* (The people, the people belong to my lord); *Bo dia Poluliya hilawo eyanggu* (But not as my lord pleases). This means that a sub-district head holds all power, but he or she must not exercise it arbitrarily. In this way, a sub-district head receives customary respect, and they are "Traditional activities are the main priority," (interview results, November 25, 2024)*

The IM source's explanation emphasized that a civil servant (ASN) appointed as a sub-district

head must not only meet administrative requirements, such as education and rank, but also meet an undocumented requirement, namely acceptance within the community they lead, particularly the customary laws prevailing in Gorontalo. The results of an interview with the second source, DK, are as follows:

"Educational background remains a factor considered in the appointment of a sub-district head. However, other factors also influence it. Even if a person has a government degree but does not meet other requirements, particularly those related to leadership, having a track record in the community will be a primary consideration for the performance assessment team when proposing him as sub-district head. Because a sub-district head is a regional leader, he must be accepted by the community." (Interview, November 25, 2024)

The explanation above explains that the Gorontalo City Government imposes other requirements, in addition to education as the primary requirement for appointing sub-district heads, as stipulated in Article 224 of Law 23 of 2014 concerning Regional Government. These other factors include the leadership skills of a civil servant (ASN) prior to being appointed as sub-district head and acceptance within the community. Based on the results of interviews with the third source, ZS, the following:

"The provisions of Article 224 of Law 23 concerning Regional Government are clear and firm. The appointment or placement of sub-district heads must be civil servants who have mastered the technical aspects of government, as evidenced by a diploma. The appointment or placement of sub-district heads is entirely the responsibility of the district/city government, and there is no intervention from the Provincial Government or the Provincial Civil Service Agency. As long as it is carried out in accordance with the provisions. Because clearly, as a representative of the central government, Article 224 also states, the Governor has the authority to cancel the appointment of sub-district heads who do not comply with the provisions, especially regarding educational background. However, so far in Gorontalo, there has never been a Governor's decision to cancel the appointment of sub-district heads made by the Regent/Mayor, even though judging from the titles of these sub-district heads, many do not match the technical background of government. It is possible that there are other mechanisms that have been or should be implemented after the appointment of sub-district heads to ensure there are no violations. For example, attending civil service training, because that is also required for sub-district heads who do not have a background in government education. However, the Provincial BKD has never evaluated the appointment of sub-district heads, or "We have received reports regarding the participation of civil servants (ASN) who are candidates for sub-district head or appointed sub-district heads in regencies/cities who are participating in civil service training. Indeed, matters between regional governments fall under the jurisdiction of the Government Bureau, with the Regional Personnel Agency (BKD) as the technical personnel agency," (interview, November 4, 2024).

The interview results above indicate that educational background is a mandatory consideration and a primary factor in appointing a civil servant to the position of sub-district head. This is expressly stated in Article 224 of Law 23 of 2014 concerning regional government. Otherwise, civil service training must be completed. As the representative of the central government in the region, the governor has the authority to revoke the appointment of a sub-district head made by the regent/mayor, as stipulated in Article 224 paragraph 3 of Law 23 of 2014 concerning regional government. However, this authority has never been exercised because the Governor or the Gorontalo Provincial Regional Personnel Agency (BKD) have never received a report or conducted an evaluation regarding the appointment of a sub-district head made by the regent/mayor. This is because the appointment of a sub-district head is the sole authority of the regent/mayor. Based on the interview with the fourth source, BI, the following explanation was

given:

"The appointment of sub-district heads fully complies with applicable laws and regulations. For example, Government Regulation No. 11 of 2017 concerning Civil Servant (PNS) Management outlines the mechanisms and requirements, including educational background requirements for holding the sub-district head position. Local wisdom is also taken into consideration, without overriding existing regulations, as there is also a performance assessment team. Law No. 23 of 2014 concerning Regional Government does indeed stipulate competency standards based on educational qualifications. That's why it's a primary consideration. For example, the position of Head of the Public Order Agency (Satpol PP) requires a Civil Servant Investigator (PPNS) certificate, and none of them possess one. Therefore, upon appointment, a written statement stating that PPNS training must be completed within 100 days. There's a saying, "educate first, then sit," or "sit first, then educate." That's how sub-district heads should be, as the priority is their leadership. I was once offered the position of sub-district head in Kota Tengah when the sub-district was first divided. However, because my education background is a bachelor's degree in education, I was rejected. "That's the requirement," (interview November 14, 2024)

The interview results indicate that the Gorontalo City Government continues to prioritize educational competency as the primary requirement, but also prioritizes several other requirements, such as local wisdom related to Gorontalo City customs. A person appointed as a sub-district head must possess leadership qualities, as assessed by the performance assessment team. Based on this, someone with government education qualifications may be denied the position of sub-district head and replaced by another competent civil servant, but with the condition that they must attend civil service training after their inauguration. Based on the interview with the fifth informant, YK, the following explanation was given:

"Unlike high-ranking or echelon II positions, the sub-district head position is not subject to open bidding (open selection). The sub-district head is an echelon III or administrator position that still uses an appointment system based on the considerations of the performance assessment team (TPK), formerly known as Baperjakat (Position and Rank Consideration Agency). Indeed, currently we consider educational qualifications and performance. But the requirements for holding an echelon III position, which determines which position a civil servant (ASN) will occupy, according to the study program/major, are set in the job competency standards (SKJ). The SKJ will later differentiate between technical and non-technical agencies. For example, the head of a division in the Public Works (PU) and Health Departments, there are technical standards for the SKJ that differentiate. In the placement of echelon III positions (including sub-district heads), we also refer to Government Regulation (PP) number 11, where the main requirement is a bachelor's degree (S1), which must be met first. After that, many other factors are considered, then discussed by the performance assessment team (TPK). Every transfer or appointment of an official is under the authority of the TPK. For example (in addition to the main requirements), there are considerations Other examples include track records and experience in positions. For example, for sub-district heads, they must have experience in regional positions, such as sub-district secretary, sub-district staff, or village heads. There are indeed stipulations that candidates must have a bachelor's degree in government. There was even a letter from the Minister of Home Affairs stating that candidates must be graduates of the National College of Public Administration (STPDN) or have participated in civil service training. Sub-district heads who do not meet the educational qualifications participate in civil service training. Some sit first and then receive training, while others receive training first and then sit." (interview, November 14, 2024)

The interview results indicate that the requirement for appointing a sub-district head (district head) is to have a technical understanding of government, as evidenced by a bachelor's degree in government. This is not an absolute requirement for civil servants within the Gorontalo City Government to hold the position. The regional government has authorized a performance assessment team to determine whether a person is eligible for the position, based on educational competency (only a bachelor's degree, not necessarily a bachelor's degree in government), performance, and regional office experience. Appointed sub-district heads without a bachelor's degree in government must have completed civil service training. However, some sub-district heads have been appointed without attending civil service training, citing performance and experience as reasons. The interview with the sixth informant, HA, explained the following:

"In appointing a sub-district head, the main consideration is a bachelor's degree and meeting the rank criteria. That's what's being considered. I have a bachelor's degree, but not in government. So, the civil service training was a factor in my appointment as sub-district head. There are some sub-district heads who weren't appointed to the STPDN (government) training program. Therefore, we need to demonstrate our performance so that the mayor doesn't make the wrong choice in appointing us to the position." (Interview, October 17, 2024)

Interviews with HA, a sub-district head with no government education background, indicate that educational qualifications are a consideration in appointing a civil servant to the position, taking into account the civil service training requirements. As someone without a government education background, HA was still appointed to the position due to other factors, including a qualified rank, performance results based on the TPK assessment, and attendance at civil service training. This appointment complies with statutory provisions, namely Law 23 of 2014 concerning Regional Government. The interview with the seventh informant, SS, explained the following:

"It's indeed better to have a background in government education. It must meet the required educational requirements, especially as it's clearly stated in the law. If not, at least participate in technical guidance (Bimtek) or civil service training. Some people sit first, then take the training. I think this is a common occurrence throughout Indonesia. Sub-district heads are echelon III. Before assuming echelon III, they must first undergo PIM IV training, followed by PIM III for echelon III. Sometimes the reason is budgetary, as training providers are only available at the provincial level; as far as I know, there are no district/city levels. So, sub-district heads don't have to be STPDN graduates, but a government degree is fine. A public administration degree is good, and a government administration degree is also good, as long as it's related to government." (Interview, October 17, 2024)

The explanation from the interview with informant SS, a sub-district head with a government education background (Bachelor of Applied Government), indicates that the requirements stipulated in the regulation include: Law No. 23 of 2014 concerning Regional Government, the sub-district head position should be filled by a civil servant with a government education background. Government graduates or civil servants with a government education background, not only alumni of the State Government College (STPDN, currently IPDN), but also graduates of other universities with a government education background such as a public administration graduate, a government administration graduate, or a government science graduate, are allowed to occupy the sub-district head position. The placement of the sub-district head position in accordance with existing statutory provisions, indicates that the Regional Government complies with applicable provisions, and does not appoint sub-district heads simply because of likes and dislikes (likes and dislikes), or because of other factors outside the existing provisions. An interview with the eighth source, AKP, explained the following:

"As far as I know, educational background doesn't require a bachelor's degree; the

important thing is that the person has a degree. The process for selecting sub-district heads varies; performance is the primary focus. I was once the regional head of the National Education Office Branch in one region, and even two regions simultaneously. That's the barometer for determining whether someone can be promoted, including the absence of disciplinary violations. The most important thing is the ability to lead the community. Loyalty to superiors is also assessed. Loyalty is one measure, along with discipline, work responsibility, and work ethic, which are all factors that leaders consider when appointing sub-district heads." (Interview, November 28)

The interview with the sub-district head, who did not have a government education background, shows that the appointment of sub-district heads in Gorontalo City does not consider the government education background that is the benchmark for civil servants to hold the position. Instead, various other factors are considered, such as performance or work experience within the region, not at the sub-district or village office, as well as loyalty, leadership, and work ethic. Interview with the ninth informant, KP, a sub-district head with a non-governmental educational background. He explained:

"Educational background is important, at least a bachelor's degree. However, experience is crucial. Many people have government backgrounds, but when they appear in the community or solve problems, they often become stiff. What's important is that the sub-district head is able to solve problems, not run away from them. Performance is what's important for holding the sub-district head position. The sub-district head must also be able to understand the characteristics of the region and the community. The sub-district head position is related to character, behavior, integrity, discipline, and work performance. I'm a technocrat assigned to the sub-district head position. I don't have a government education background. I've attended training courses, such as the Public Service Implementation Training (PIM), but I haven't attended civil service training yet, because I think what's valued is experience and performance," (interview, November 28, 2024).

Interviews with KP sources indicate that the appointment of sub-district heads does not prioritize government educational background for civil servants (ASN) to hold sub-district heads, but rather prioritizes work experience, integrity, character, and leadership, which will enable them to address issues within the sub-district. Government educational background, as stipulated in Article 224 of Law 23 of 2014 concerning Regional Government, is not used as the primary basis by the Gorontalo City government for appointing civil servants/civil servants to sub-district heads. Based on interviews with all the aforementioned sources, the appointment process for sub-district heads in Gorontalo City is based on educational background, as stipulated in Article 224 of Law 23 of 2014 concerning regional government.

Most respondents indicated that a minimum bachelor's degree (S1) is the primary basis for appointing civil servants to sub-district heads. The educational background referred to here is not limited to a background in Government Science, as stipulated in Article 224 of Law 23 of 2014 concerning Regional Government, which requires sub-district heads to master government technical skills, as evidenced by a diploma or bachelor's degree in government. This applies to all levels of education. Consequently, in Gorontalo City, with each transfer or appointment of sub-district heads, civil servants without a government education background occupy the position. The following is a list of sub-district head appointments in Gorontalo City from 2017 to 2024.

Table 1. List of Sub-district Heads in Gorontalo City in 2017

No	Subdistrict	Name of Sub-district Head
1	Kota Selatan	Muh. Mulky Datau, S.STP
2	Kota Barat	Thamrin Husain, S.Pd., MM

3	Sipatana	Israk Ali, SE
4	Kota Timur	Eladona Oktamina Sidiki, S.STP., M.Si
5	Dungingi	Sriyanti Ano, SP
6	Kota Tengah	Nurahman Rais Monoarfa, SH.MH
7	Dumboraya	Sumaryadi Tone, S.STP., M.Si
8	Kota Utara	Nurdin Mohammad, S.Ag
9	Hulondalangi	Lukman Laisa, S.STP

Source: Gorontalo City Regional Secretariat

Table 2. List of Sub-district Heads in Gorontalo City in 2024

No	Subdistrict	Name of Sub-district Head
1	Kota Selatan	Sumaryadi Tone, S.STP, M.Si
2	Kota Barat	Abdl Karim Panu, S.Pd
3	Sipatana	Lukman Laisa, S.STP
4	Kota Timur	Mirna Tome, S.Pd
5	Dungingi	Heriyanto M.Abas, SE
6	Kota Tengah	Sutami Suratinoyo, S.STP., M.Si
7	Dumboraya	Marwan Saleh, S.STP, M.Si
8	Kota Utara	Sofyan Butolo, S.IP., M.Si
9	Hulondalangi	Kasim Pilobu, ST

Source: Gorontalo City Regional Secretariat

The two sub-district head appointments described in the table above are due to the fact that some sub-district heads still hold positions without a government education background. For example, in 2017, of the nine sub-district head positions, five had educational backgrounds other than government, and in the 2024 sub-district head appointments, four still had non-government education backgrounds. In fact, the Gorontalo City Government applies several determining factors in accordance with Government Regulation Number 11 of 2017 concerning Civil Servant Management, and is based on the assessment of the Performance Assessment Team (TPK). The TPK was previously the Rank and Position Consideration Agency (Baperjakat) established by the Mayor of Gorontalo. The TPK assesses candidates' performance, leadership qualities, and lack of a record of immoral behavior within the community. The moral standing and track record of a candidate for sub-district head are important factors in determining whether a civil servant (ASN) is appointed to the position of sub-district head in Gorontalo City. This is because sub-district heads are not only the government leaders of their respective districts but also the traditional leaders within their jurisdiction. Therefore, despite these various requirements, educational background is not the primary factor in appointing civil servants to the position of sub-district head in Gorontalo City.

Selection Method

The appointment of sub-district heads within the Gorontalo City Government is carried out by considering several factors. After educational qualifications, factors such as rank, work experience, and track record are also determining factors. The Gorontalo City Government does not employ an open selection process, as is the case for the selection or placement of high-ranking officials (JPT) or echelon II. The sub-district head position, which is at echelon IIIa or Administrative Position (JA), is the reason for not appointing or filling the sub-district head position through an open selection process. Article 13 of Government Regulation Number 17 of 2018 concerning Sub-districts stipulates that the appointment of sub-district heads is conducted through a selection mechanism in accordance with applicable laws and regulations.

In this case, the selection of echelon III positions, or JA, refers to the provisions of Government Regulation (PP) Number 11 of 2017 concerning Civil Servant Management (PNS). JA is a

group of positions that encompass functions and duties related to public services, government administration, and development. The following is an interview with the first source regarding the sub-district head selection method within the Gorontalo City Government, as conveyed by IM:

"The selection process must comply with administrative requirements (regulations). Sub-district heads are echelon III plus, not the same as department heads. Echelon III officers handle the territory. Therefore, the selection of sub-district heads requires more requirements than other echelon III positions. They must have strong leadership skills, excellent communication skills, and community acceptance must also be considered. Therefore, character is a key consideration, as sub-district heads are regional heads at the sub-district level. Acceptance from the community is key." (Interview, November 25, 2025)

The explanation in the interview shows that the sub-district head selection process conducted by the Gorontalo City Government applies the requirements stipulated in Government Regulation Number 11 of 2017 concerning Civil Servant Management. These requirements include a minimum of a bachelor's degree (S1), good integrity and morals to be accepted by the community, and strong leadership and/or work experience. The resource person also explained that a civil servant who is appointed as a sub-district head in Gorontalo City must be accepted by the community, especially in relation to the implementation of customs in the community. The following is an additional interview with IM:

"From a traditional perspective, they are the backbone of the nation. The sub-district head's oath includes the "moloopu" (the oath of allegiance). The formal process, both under positive law and under customary law, involves customary law requirements. There is a toopu (customary oath). These are: "Huta, huta lo ito Eya" (The land belongs to my lord); "Tulu, tulu lo ito Eya" (Fire belongs to my lord); "Dupoto, dupoto lo ito Eya" (Wind, wind belongs to my lord); "Tawu, tawu lo ito Eya" (The people, the people belong to my lord); "Bo dia Poluliya hilawo eyanggu" (But not as my lord pleases). This means that power exists, all within the grasp of the sub-district head, but it cannot be used arbitrarily. Therefore, all sub-district heads receive customary respect. This is why there are customary ceremonies, and in every traditional event, they (the sub-district heads) are the primary ones." (interview, November 25, 2025)

The results of the interview showed that the placement of a civil servant for the position of sub-district head is closely related to the customs and traditional life of the Gorontalo people, so that the requirements for acceptance in the community, in this case related to Gorontalo customs, become input for the performance assessment team (TPK) to be proposed to the Personnel Development Officer (PPK), in this case the Mayor of Gorontalo who has the authority to appoint a civil servant to the position of sub-district head. Furthermore, regarding the selection method, the following is the result of an interview with the second source, namely the Special Allocation Fund (DAK):

"The sub-district head selection method must of course comply with existing regulations. The Mayor has always avoided any appointments, not just sub-district heads, that would become problematic due to regulatory violations. The priority is provisions, such as Government Regulation No. 11 of 2017 concerning ASN Management, which clearly stipulates the rules for filling echelon III positions. The sub-district head is echelon III, so we refer to that. After that, several names are submitted to the performance assessment team. They are assessed for their requirements, criteria, and leadership qualities, as they lead the region. Only then are they proposed to the Mayor." (Interview, November 25, 2024)

The explanation above demonstrates that the sub-district head selection method is carried out

while prioritizing applicable regulations, such as Government Regulation No. 11 of 2017 concerning State Civil Apparatus (ASN) Management, which is then approved by the Agency. Regional Civil Service is proposed to the Performance Assessment Team (TPK), which then submits it to the Mayor, who serves as the Personnel Development Officer, who has the authority to appoint sub-district heads. Civil servants must meet administrative requirements to hold the sub-district head position, including rank, echelon, and experience. Leadership skills are also required. Based on an interview with a third source regarding the selection mechanism for appointing sub-district heads, ZS stated the following:

"The appointment of sub-district heads, including the selection process, is entirely the responsibility of the district/city government. Sub-districts are not part of the provincial government but fall directly under the authority of the Regent or Mayor. However, it is also expected that the selection process and filling of sub-district heads must be carried out in accordance with applicable regulations. The Governor, as the representative of the central government in the regions, clearly has the authority to revoke the appointment of sub-district heads who do not comply with regulations. The sub-district head position is strategic because it directly relates to the community and controls the territory, so it is also important to consider their acceptance within the community." (interview, November 4, 2024)

This explanation indicates that the sub-district head selection process is entirely the responsibility of the Regency/City Government, or in this case, the Regent and Mayor. According to Article 209 paragraph 2 of Law Number 23 of 2014 concerning Regional Government, sub-districts are part of the Regency/City government. The Provincial Government or Governor, as the representative of the central government in the regions, reminded that the selection process must comply with statutory provisions. Article 224 of Law No. 23 of 2014 stipulates that the Governor has the authority to revoke the appointment of a sub-district head (camatan) resulting from a selection process that does not comply with regulations. Furthermore, based on an interview with the fourth informant, Mr. BI, regarding the selection method for appointing sub-district heads, he explained the following:

"The selection mechanism is very clear. A sub-district head is an administrative position or echelon III. Whether they are sub-district heads or not, the selection process refers to the provisions of Government Regulation (PP) No. 11 of 2017, which has mechanisms and requirements. This is the basis for selecting or filling sub-district heads, ensuring proper order; all these requirements are met for holding the position. Other requirements, such as obtaining a recommendation from a traditional leader during the selection process, are beneficial. However, this has not been implemented, as it still adheres to existing regulations. However, this remains a consideration, as sub-district heads lead the community." (interview, November 14, 2024)

Based on the interview results, it shows that the sub-district head selection method in Gorontalo City is still based on the provisions as stipulated in Government Regulation number 11 of 2017 concerning State Civil Apparatus Management (ASN). Sub-district heads who are classified as Administrator positions, the selection procedures are regulated as per Article 54 paragraph 1, PP number 11 of 2017 concerning Civil Servant Management. Namely a. have civil servant status; b. have qualifications and education level of at least a bachelor's degree or diploma IV; c. have good integrity and morality; d. have experience in a supervisory position for at least 3 (three) years or a Functional Position equivalent to the supervisory position in accordance with the field of duties of the position to be occupied; e. each element of work performance assessment has at least a good value in the last 2 (two) years; f. Have technical competence, managerial competence, and socio-cultural competence according to competency standards as proven based on the results of an evaluation by the civil servant performance assessment team in their agency; and g. be physically and mentally healthy. In the implementation of the sub-

district head selection in Gorontalo City, the Gorontalo City Government does not implement recommendations from traditional institutions, but still considers the track record of sub-district head candidates, including the track record of individual behavior of the candidate within the community, so that it is in accordance with the customary provisions applicable in Gorontalo City society. The fifth interview with the fifth source, Ms. YK, explained the following:

"The filling of echelon III a administrator positions and below does not yet use an open selection system. We are currently developing a talent management system. The selection method itself, because it does not yet use an open assessment system, uses discussions within the Performance Assessment Team (TPK). However, competency, qualifications, and performance are still assessed. These will be the considerations in the TPK. The TPK is established by the Mayor, and its decree is amended annually. It consists of the Regional Secretary as chair, elements from the supervisory inspectorate, the organizational division, and the Civil Service Agency. We used to know it as Baperjakat." (Interview, November 14, 2024)

Based on the source's explanation, it was revealed that the selection method for appointing sub-district heads in Gorontalo City does not yet use an open bidding system. Instead, it uses a closed system, fully utilizing discussions within the Performance Assessment Team (TPK) and is based on the provisions stipulated in Government Regulation (PP) Number 11 of 2017 concerning State Civil Apparatus (ASN) Management. The TPK (Committee for Civil Servants) is an ad hoc body formed annually by the Mayor of Gorontalo. It consists of the Regional Secretary, the Government Assistant, the Inspectorate, the National Unity and Politics Agency (Kesbangpol), and the Civil Service Agency. This team will then brainstorm candidates for the sub-district head position before submitting them to the Mayor of Gorontalo, who will determine who will fill the position. Going forward, the sub-district head position will be filled using a talent management system, assessing the abilities of civil servants based on their aptitude for leadership in the sub-district or other fields. This system underpins the Job Competency Standards (SKJ). The SKJ will then determine whether civil servants can occupy technical positions, such as those in the Public Works and Spatial Planning Department or the Health Department, which have their own technical standards. The following is the result of an interview with the sixth source, HA:

"The sub-district head selection process involves a performance assessment team (TPK). The TPK will provide input to the regional head to determine who will fill a particular position. Of course, I believe all officials appointed are based on careful consideration, not just random appointments. My position as sub-district head was determined by my ability and performance. The sub-district head is not only a regional government leader, but also a political mentor and a traditional leader within the sub-district. There are things called bate (regional traditional leaders), etc. As leaders, we are treated with customary respect (moloopu). Therefore, when serving as sub-district head, we must maintain our morals and avoid being dishonored. Leaders are very vulnerable. If we use negative language that harms the community, it will create a negative image, and that is difficult to erase. As far as I know, that's the TPK's consideration in determining the sub-district head position." (interview, October 17, 2024)

Based on the source's explanation, it was stated that the selection of sub-district heads is entirely the responsibility of a performance assessment team (TPK) formed by the Mayor of Gorontalo. Civil servants (ASN) who hold the position of sub-district head are assessed based on their eligibility for the position, both in terms of regulations, such as rank and administrative requirements, and in terms of their track record, both in terms of performance and their individual life within the community, such as having good morals and being above reproach. In addition to ensuring compliance with regulatory requirements, sub-district heads in Gorontalo City are advised to obtain a recommendation from a traditional institution. This is

because the sub-district head position in Gorontalo City also serves as the traditional leader in the region. The following is an additional interview with the sixth source, HA:

"The sub-district head and village head should have a recommendation from the traditional council/institution. The customary law stipulates that the sub-district head and village head must receive a recommendation from the traditional institution to determine whether they are fit for office. Because the sub-district head is not just a leader in the sub-district office and the village heads, but also a leader in the community." (interview, October 17, 2024)

This additional explanation from the source emphasized that the sub-district head selection method in Gorontalo City should include an additional criterion: a recommendation from the traditional council or institution within the sub-district. The recommendation from the traditional council or institution is crucial because it indicates that the person who will eventually hold the position of sub-district head is free from any record of misconduct or bad morals, according to customary law. The following is an interview with the seventh source regarding the sub-district head selection method, with Mr. SS:

"For echelon III positions, in other regions there's job bidding, and in the Ministry as well. So the basic rules are in place. Regarding appointments, during the time of Mr. AD (Adhan Dambea, Mayor of Gorontalo 2008-2013), all echelons II, III, and IV were subject to personnel competency development from the Financial and Development Supervisory Agency (BPKP). There were psychological tests, so person A could go one way, person B could go there. That was the case. But under Mr. MT (Marten Taha, Mayor of Gorontalo 2014-2024), that's no longer the case. Because there are no regulations, only regional head policies. If there's no selection process, invite external parties to conduct the assessment." (Interview, October 17, 2024)

Based on the source's explanation, it shows that the sub-district head selection method should be able to use a job bidding system, as similar practices have been implemented in several regions, even for echelon positions. Level III (equivalent to the sub-district head echelon) in several ministries uses an open selection method for certain positions. The selection policy for sub-district heads can currently be implemented at the discretion of the regional head. This was implemented during the 2008-2013 administration of the Mayor of Gorontalo, who implemented a psychological selection process for civil servants (ASN) to qualify for certain positions, including sub-district heads, within the Gorontalo City Government. Civil servants who pass the psychological test are awarded a certificate of eligibility, allowing the performance assessment team or the Position and Rank Consideration Agency (Bapperjakat) to easily classify them for specific positions. The resource person also suggested involving external parties in determining civil servant positions, as open selection methods are not used. The following is an interview with the eighth source regarding the selection method, namely the District Head (AKP):

"The process for selecting sub-district heads varies. The primary assessment is performance. I was once the regional head of the Education Office Branch in one region, and even two regions simultaneously. That's the barometer for determining whether someone is eligible for promotion. This includes ensuring a lack of disciplinary violations and their ability to lead the community. In my experience in education, we also protect the community, namely the parents of students. Loyalty to superiors is also a key factor. Loyalty is one measure, along with discipline, responsibility at work, and work ethic." (Interview, November 28, 2024)

The interview results indicate that the sub-district head selection process prioritizes the experience of civil servants (ASN) as candidates for election. Candidates must also be free from disciplinary violations, demonstrate loyalty, possess leadership qualities, a strong work

ethic, and be responsible. This aligns with Article 54, paragraph 1, Government Regulation Number 11 of 2017 concerning Civil Servant Management. Civil servants occupying administrative positions must possess integrity and good morals, have at least three years of experience in supervisory positions or in functional positions equivalent to supervisory positions related to the field of work they will be occupying, and have received at least a good rating for each element of their performance assessment within the last two years. The interviewee also explained that the sub-district head selection process in Gorontalo City prioritizes local wisdom through the involvement of traditional institutions. The following is an additional interview with the eighth AKP source:

"As far as I know, the appointment of a sub-district head must go through a consultation with a traditional institution. This is crucial; there must be collaboration between the traditional institution and the local government. The recommendation from the traditional institution is crucial because the sub-district head leads the community in the region, so there must be no customary flaws. As a sub-district leader, the sub-district head has the potential to receive a pulanga (religious title), and once a sub-district head is held to customary law, he or she is already bound by customary law and serves as an example in the community. For example, if there's an event, it's no longer appropriate to sing on stage, etc.; he or she is already bound by customary law." (Interview, November 28, 2024)

Based on the results of this interview, it is clear that the appointment and selection of sub-district heads in Gorontalo City involves customary elements, resulting from collaboration between the traditional institution and the local government, in this case the performance assessment team (TPK). The recommendation from the traditional institution for a civil servant (ASN) to hold the position of sub-district head is crucial to ensure the sub-district head is free from ethical and customary violations. This is because, in Gorontalo traditional tradition, a sub-district head has the potential to receive the Gorontalo customary title, Pulanga. The traditional title of "ulanga" (religious title) is awarded to a leader based on an individual's track record of dedication, performance, and behavior within the family and community. The following is an interview with the ninth source, regarding the selection process for the sub-district head position, namely Mr. KP:

"The selection process falls under the authority of the Mayor. I observe that the Mayor has a special assessment of civil servants who have the potential to become sub-district heads. Therefore, the requirements are not limited to educational background alone; the most important are experience, work management, problem-solving skills, and the ability to identify potential problems and resolve them. As a sub-district head, the entire sub-district faces numerous issues. Waste, community disputes, public order and security, and disasters in the area must be mastered and resolved as quickly as possible." (Interview, November 28, 2024)

The interview results indicate that the Mayor, as the Personnel Development Officer (PPK), has full authority in determining whether a civil servant can hold the position of sub-district head. The Mayor is considered to have specific criteria in appointing civil servants to sub-district heads, taking into account their abilities, such as experience, leadership management, problem-solving skills, and teamwork. The Mayor's or the City Civil Service Officer (PPK)'s authority in appointing civil servants is in accordance with Article 1, paragraph 17 of Government Regulation (PP) No. 11 of 2017 concerning Civil Service Management (ASN), which states that the Civil Service Development Officer (PPK) is authorized to determine the appointment, transfer, and dismissal of civil servants and to provide management guidance for civil servants in government agencies in accordance with statutory provisions.

Interviews with the nine sources indicate that the selection model used by the Gorontalo City Government to appoint civil servants to sub-district heads is not yet an open bidding system. Instead, the sub-district head selection process is conducted through a centralized assessment

conducted by a performance assessment team (TPK). The TPK is an ad hoc body established by the Mayor of Gorontalo based on a mayoral decree. It is led by the Regional Secretary and comprises members from the Inspectorate, the National Unity and Politics Agency, and the Regional Civil Service Agency. The TPK will assess civil servants (ASN) deemed to meet the criteria for the sub-district head position. The assessment is based on Government Regulation (PP) Number 11 of 2017 concerning the Management of State Civil Apparatus (ASN), which places sub-district heads in the Administrator Position (JA) category.

Setelah mendapatkan calon camat yang sesuai dengan kriteria sebagaimana diatur dalam PP Nomor 11 Tahun 2017 tentang ASN, dan sesuai dengan ketentuan kehidupan adat masyarakat Gorontalo, TPK merekomendasikan ke Wali Kota sebagai Pejabat Pembina Kepegawaian. Wali Kota dengan kewenangannya dapat menentukan ASN yang menduduki camat. Dalam prakteknya, Wali Kota juga memperhatikan ketentuan adat yang berlaku di masyarakat Gorontalo, sehingga calon camat yang nantinya dilantik sebagai camat, apakah layak memimpin masyarakat di wilayah dan juga menjadi pemimpin adat di wilayah penugasan. Ketentuan berkaitan dengan faktor adat, tidak tertulis secara regulasi negara, namun dijadikan patokan Wali Kota untuk menentukan satu orang yang terpilih menjadi camat. Dalam kehidupan adat masyarakat Gorontalo, jabatan camat yang merupakan pemimpin wilayah yang tidak hanya bertanggungjawab terhadap urusan administrasi pemerintahan, tetapi juga merupakan pihak yang berperan penting dalam menjaga dan melaksanakan aturan adat di wilayah kecamatan.

Availability of Human Resources

The availability of human resources (HR) is a key determinant in filling the sub-district head position. According to Article 224 of Law Number 23 of 2014 concerning Regional Government, civil servants (ASN) occupying the position of sub-district head must possess technical knowledge of government affairs, as evidenced by a government diploma and/or a civil service certificate. This provision requires that a sub-district head have completed government education or graduated from a government study program, as evidenced by a diploma. Civil servants without a government education background may hold the position of sub-district head, provided they have completed civil service education and training, as evidenced by a certificate of education and training.

This provision indicates that not all civil servants in Gorontalo City have the opportunity to hold the position of sub-district head. In addition to the educational background stipulated in Law Number 23 of 2014 concerning Regional Government, there are other administrative requirements stipulated in Government Regulation Number 11 of 2017 concerning Civil Service Management (ASN). The following is an interview with the first source, Mr. IM, regarding the availability of Human Resources (HR) that meet the criteria for a sub-district head position in Gorontalo City:

"The number of civil servants with government backgrounds is sufficient and available, but other factors also determine whether a civil servant can be appointed to the sub-district head position. This goes back to leadership." (Interview, November 25, 2024)

Based on the interview results, it shows that the availability of Human Resources (HR), or the number of Civil Servants (ASN) who master government technical skills, proven by diplomas and government educational backgrounds, as stipulated in Law Number 23 of 2014 concerning Regional Government, is not lacking. Another factor that the Gorontalo City Government uses in making decisions about appointing a civil servant to the sub-district head position is not based on educational background requirements. These other factors include leadership skills, track record, and performance appraisals. Furthermore, regarding the availability of Human Resources, the following is an interview with the second source, Mr. DAK:

——— *"The number "There are many civil servants with a government degree, and we don't have*

a shortage. There are many graduates of STPN/IPDN, or also graduates of government study programs from other universities who are now civil servants. And for those who aren't government study program graduates, there are also those who have participated in civil service training. So I don't think there's a shortage," (interview, November 25, 2024)

The interview results indicate that there is a shortage of Human Resources (HR) in the form of State Civil Apparatus (ASN) with government education backgrounds, as stipulated in Article 224 of Law Number 23 of 2014 concerning Regional Government. Therefore, the Mayor of Gorontalo has no difficulty in placing ASN according to the provisions for sub-district heads in Gorontalo City. In addition to the sufficient number of ASN with educational backgrounds, many ASN have also participated in Civil Service Training. The following is an interview with the third source regarding the availability of Human Resources, namely Mr. ZS:

"Because the regulations are clear, sub-district heads must have a background in government education, the local government should have a sufficient number of civil servants (ASN) who meet this requirement, at least as many as there are sub-districts in the regency/city. However, the appointment of sub-district heads is entirely the responsibility of the Regent or Mayor. But I think there's a large supply currently, especially since there are STPDN/IPDN graduates every year, and promotions are also periodic, so I don't think there's a shortage." (Interview, November 4)

Based on the source's explanation, it shows that the regency/city government must provide civil servants who meet the criteria stipulated in Article 224 of Law Number 23 of 2014 concerning Regional Government, at least as many as there are sub-district head positions in the regency/city. The regulations governing this are clear and should serve as a guideline. The appointment of sub-district heads is the sole authority of the Regent/Mayor, as sub-district heads are part of the regency/city apparatus. The following is the result of an interview with the fourth source, Mr. BI, regarding the availability of qualified human resources (ASN) to fill the position of sub-district head in Gorontalo City:

"If there is a supply of human resources with a government education background, there is no shortage. However, the problem is that it's only based on that factor; there are many other considerations. We have always used positive regulations as a foundation, unwritten rules, and recommendations from traditional customs can serve as references. For example, in South Kota District, there has never been a female sub-district head leading there. Usually, senior officials (in traditional matters) would convey the need for attention to the Jami Mosque (Grand Mosque), so there have never been any sub-district heads who met there." (Interview, November 14, 2024)

Based on the source's explanation above, it indicates that the availability of human resources meeting the criteria stipulated in Law 23 of 2014 concerning Regional Government has been met. In the implementation of the sub-district head appointment model in Gorontalo City, provisions such as educational background, as stipulated in Law 23 of 2014 concerning Regional Government, are not the primary factor. Instead, various other factors are considered, including input related to Gorontalo's customary practices. Furthermore, the fifth interview with the fifth informant regarding human resource availability, Mrs. YK, explained the following:

"The number of civil servants with government education qualifications is sufficient, not a shortage. Most have a bachelor's degree. Government knowledge is sufficient, but experience, track record, and regional expertise are what matter. The number of human resources with government education is sufficient." (interview, November 14, 2024)

The interview results indicate that the number of civil servants with government education qualifications is sufficient or sufficient, thus ensuring human resource availability is not a

problem. In Gorontalo City, nine sub-districts require nine civil servants (PNS) to fill the sub-district head position. According to data from the Gorontalo City Government Employment Agency (BKPP), there are approximately 250 civil servants with government education backgrounds, either undergraduate or master's degrees. This number significantly exceeds the current requirement for sub-district head positions in Gorontalo City. In practice, government education is not the primary factor in appointing sub-district heads; several other factors are considered, such as experience, leadership skills, and regional expertise, or having served in areas such as village or sub-district offices or Gorontalo City Government work units within the sub-district. The following is the interview with the sixth source, HA:

"As civil servants, of course, we are ready to be placed anywhere, including this sub-district head position. I'm not sure about the availability of human resources with a suitable government educational background; perhaps the data is available at the Regional Development Planning Agency (BKPP). But to become a sub-district head, there are other requirements. Many meet the requirements based on educational background and rank, but not competency. The first factor to become a sub-district head is rank and class, secondly, competence and performance. Leadership skills are essential and must have been trained in leadership (pamong). You can participate first, or you can hold a position first and then join. I participated in the civil service training. Before becoming a sub-district head, I was a division head. I worked my way up through the ranks: from IIC, I was a staff member at the Liliwo sub-district for 1.3 years. I served as a section head in the Kota Tengah sub-district for four years. I moved to the Regional Work Unit (SKPD) for Industry, Trade, and Cooperatives, and now I'm a sub-district head." (Interview, October 17, 2024)

Based on the interview results This indicates that the availability of human resources (HR), as stipulated in Article 224 of Law No. 23 of 2014 concerning Regional Government, is not a determining factor in appointing a civil servant to the position of sub-district head. The determining factors are rank, competency, experience, and performance. Performance assessments are determined by a performance assessment team (TPK) established by the Mayor of Gorontalo. The following is an interview with the seventh source regarding the availability of human resources (HR), namely Mr. SS:

"Even STPDN/IPDN alumni are numerous, with ranks like mine. I don't think there's a shortage. Being a sub-district head doesn't require a STPDN, but a government degree is possible, a public administration degree is good, or a government administration degree is possible. However, intervention is possible, but the obstacle is that the PPK (Regional Head Officer) is a political figure, not a Regional Secretary with a career in the bureaucracy." (Interview, October 17, 2024)

The interview results indicate that the availability of human resources (HR) in the form of civil servants (ASN) with government education backgrounds and appropriate ranks is not lacking, and in fact, it exceeds the number of sub-districts in Gorontalo City. The influence of intervention from the Civil Service Development Officer (PPK) can be a factor in allowing ASN without a government education background or those with civil service certification to hold the position of sub-district head. This is because the PPK is the Regional Head, who is essentially a political official, not a career bureaucratic official. Next, the following is an interview with the eighth source regarding the availability of Human Resources to fill the sub-district head position in Gorontalo City, namely the Sub-district Head, Mr. AKP:

"The number is probably available, especially if the minimum requirement is only a bachelor's degree. I've never attended civil service training. I do have a letter, but considering the restrictions on leaving the region, especially during the COVID-19 pandemic, it's quite difficult to leave, and the training budget is always a constraint. But there are encouragements to participate." (interview, November 28, 2024)

The interview indicated that the number of Human Resources (HR) meeting the requirements as stipulated in Article 224 of Law Number 23 of 2014 concerning Regional Government is sufficient and there is no shortage. There was even a notification for sub-district heads without a government education background to immediately attend civil service training to meet the human resource needs. The following is an interview with the ninth source regarding the availability of human resources for the sub-district head position, namely Mr. KP:

"Many have a government background, but when it comes to appearing in the community or solving problems, they are actually stiff. What's important is the ability to solve problems. The sub-district head position is related to character, behavior, integrity, discipline, and work performance. There is a requirement to have attended civil service training, but I haven't attended it myself, so I'll be soon." (interview, November 28, 2024)

Based on the results of the interview above, it shows that the availability of human resources (HR) in the form of civil servants (ASN) with a government educational background is not lacking, or at least meets the minimum number of sub-district head positions in Gorontalo City. According to the source, the sub-district head is not solely determined by educational background, but also by character, integrity, and leadership skills that can resolve regional issues. Interviews with all the sources mentioned above indicate that the availability of Human Resources (HR) in the form of Civil Servants (PNS) who meet the educational qualifications required for the sub-district head position, as stipulated in Article 224 of Law Number 23 of 2014 concerning Regional Government, is not a problem, and is even greater than the number of sub-district head positions in Gorontalo City.

Data from the Gorontalo City Personnel Education and Training Agency (BKPP) indicates that there are 250 civil servants with a government education background, consisting of 237 with a bachelor's degree (S1) and 13 with a master's degree (S2). Meanwhile, the number of sub-district head positions in Gorontalo City is only nine. This number of civil servants with educational qualifications in government science does not include those who have participated in civil service training. From the fulfillment of Human Resources (HR), namely ASN within the Gorontalo City Government who have government education qualifications as required by Article 224, Law Number 23 of 2014 concerning Regional Government, the implementation of the appointment of sub-district heads should be carried out by adhering to these provisions, so as not to appoint sub-district heads from educational backgrounds other than government science.

In Gorontalo City, the availability of human resources is very sufficient and even exceeds the needs of sub-district head positions in Gorontalo City. Data from the Gorontalo City Personnel Education and Training Agency (BKPP) shows that the number of ASN with educational qualifications in government science is 250 people. This number exceeds the need for sub-district head positions in Gorontalo City, which is nine sub-districts/district heads. By looking at the composition of sub-district head positions for the nine sub-district offices in Gorontalo City, it is revealed that the placement of sub-district head positions does not pay attention to the availability of qualified personnel as stipulated in Article 224 of Law Number 23 of 2014 concerning Regional Government. The implementers, in this case the performance assessment team and the Mayor of Gorontalo, still place personnel who do not meet the competencies to occupy certain positions, especially those regulated by law.

Sedarmayanti (2018) stated that without human resources who have high competencies in their fields of work and responsibilities, the organization will fail to realize its existence. Competence is all knowledge, skills, abilities, and characteristics that enable a position holder to carry out his/her role and responsibilities, and contribute to fulfilling the needs of the organization according to the position level held. Hasibuan, (in Fitriyah & Alaydrus, 2017), developing competence according to the needs of the position can be done through education and training. Education improves the theoretical, conceptual, and moral skills of the apparatus,

while training is an activity to improve the technical skills of the implementers to improve the work of the apparatus. In the future, the appointment of sub-district heads should prioritize the availability of civil servant resources that meet the criteria as stipulated in Article 224 of Law Number 23 of 2014 concerning Regional Government, by first mapping civil servant resources, regarding the number of ASN who have government education qualifications, the number of ASN who have obtained civil service certificates, then entering the general requirements as stipulated in Government Regulation Number 11 of 2017 concerning State Civil Apparatus Management (ASN).

CONCLUSION

The model for appointing sub-district heads in Gorontalo City does not fully comply with Law Number 23 of 2014 concerning Regional Government, particularly regarding educational qualifications. The appointment of sub-district heads does not make an educational background in government science or civil service training a primary requirement. The Gorontalo City Government only requires a minimum of a bachelor's degree, thus the principle of meritocracy as stipulated in Regulation of the Minister of Administrative and Bureaucratic Reform Number 40 of 2018 has not been fully implemented in the sub-district head appointment process. The selection process for sub-district head appointments does not use an open bidding system, but rather through an assessment by the BKPP (Government Development Agency) and recommendations from the Performance Assessment Team (TPK) based on rank, track record, leadership, community acceptance, and traditional factors. Although there are sufficient personnel with technical government qualifications, the appointment of sub-district heads does not always prioritize them. The final decision remains with the Mayor, as the Personnel Development Officer, who selects one of three names recommended by the TPK.

SUGGESTION

It is recommended that the appointment of sub-district heads be conducted transparently and based on a merit system to avoid public speculation regarding nepotism or political interests. The Gorontalo City Government needs to develop specific regulations, for example through a Regional Regulation, that regulate the sub-district head appointment mechanism more clearly, transparently, and in accordance with the principles of good governance. The Gorontalo City Government is advised to comply with Article 224 of Law No. 23 of 2014, which stipulates that sub-district head positions are filled by civil servants with technical competence in the government sector, proven by a diploma in government science or a civil service training program. The government should also provide civil service training programs for non-government civil servants (ASN) to meet these qualifications. It is recommended that sub-district head appointments be conducted through an open bidding process to increase transparency, accountability, and the implementation of a merit system. The Gorontalo City Government also needs to establish standard operating procedures (SOPs) for sub-district head selection, including the use of digital applications that contain ASN track records to make the selection process more objective, measurable, and free from interference. The Gorontalo City Government is advised to improve the competency of civil servants by providing civil service training and encouraging non-governmental science graduates to pursue postgraduate studies in government. This is crucial to ensure the availability of qualified personnel for the appointment of sub-district heads and to ensure compliance with statutory regulations.

REFERENCES

- Ediagbonya, K., & Aghatise, O. J. (2023). Information and Communication Technology Competencies Acquired by Business Education Graduates Workers in Edo State Civil Service. *International Business Education Journal*, 16(2), 100-114. <https://doi.org/10.37134/ibej.Vol16.2.8.2023>

- Elsye, R. (2022). Local Government Control and Supervision. *Journal Of Positive School Psychology*, 6(8), 6967-6974.
- Fitriyah, N., & Alaydrus, A. (2017). Pengembangan Kompetensi Pegawai Dalam Rangka Pelayanan Publik Di Lingkungan Kerja Lembaga Penyiaran Publik Radio Republik Indonesia Samarinda. *Jurnal Administrative Reform*, 3(4), 477-488.
- Forkuor, D., & Adjei, P. O. W. (2016). Analysis of prospects and challenges of sub-district structures under Ghana's local governance system. *Journal of Sustainable Development*, 9(3), 130-157. <http://dx.doi.org/10.5539/jsd.v9n3p147>
- Harman, G. (1994). Student selection and admission to higher education: Policies and practices in the Asian region. *Higher Education*, 27(3), 313-339. <https://doi.org/10.1007/BF01432073>
- Mukhlis, M. M. (2025). Regional Government Autonomy in Indonesia: The Ambiguity of the Federalism of Republic Model. *Malaysian J. Syariah & L.*, 13, 35.
- Mukhlis, M. M., Maskun, M., Tajuddin, M. S., Aslan, J., Hariyanto, H., & Samosir, H. (2024). Regional autonomy system: Delegation of authority and power of regional government in Indonesia in the study of Fiqh Siyasa. *Al-Istinbath: Jurnal Hukum Islam*, 9(2), 505-526. <https://doi.org/10.29240/jhi.v9i2.9709>
- Nawawi, Z. (2017). *Manajemen Pemerintahan*. Jakarta: PT. Raja Grafindo Persada
- Ogunleye, J. (2006). A review and analysis of assessment objectives of academic and vocational qualifications in English further education, with particular reference to creativity. *Journal of Education and Work*, 19(1), 95-104. <https://doi.org/10.1080/13639080500522853>
- Salim, M. (2024). Analysis of the implementation of additional selection of village head candidates in bangkalan regency from a human rights perspective. *ACADEMOS Jurnal Hukum dan Tatahan Sosial*, 3(2). <https://doi.org/10.30651/aca.v3i2.24906>
- Sedarmayanti, H. (2018). *Manajemen sumber daya manusia; reformasi birokrasi dan manajemen pegawai negeri sipil*. Bandung: Reflika Aditama.
- Sugiyono, 2007, *Metodelogi Penelitian Kuantitatif, Kualitatif Dan R&D*, Bandung: Alfabeta
- Sugiyono, 2013, *Metode Penelitian Pendidikan Pendekatan Kuantitatif, Kualitatif, dan R&D*, Bandung: Alfabeta
- Sugiyono, 2019, *Metodelogi Penelitian Kuantitatif dan Kualitatif Dan R&D*. Bandung: Alfabeta.
- Tanjung, A. S., & Novadjaja, L. H. H. (2015). *Pengaruh Penempatan Kerja Terhadap Kinerja Karyawan (Studi Pada Eco Green Park, Kota Wisata Batu)* (Doctoral dissertation, Universitas Brawijaya).
- Zuliyah, S., & Triwahyuningsih, T. (2021). The Implementation of Regional Regulations in the Process of Filling in the Village Civil Service. *Jurnal Daulat Hukum*, 4(4), 454798. <https://doi.org/10.30659/jdh.v4i4.17989>